



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 18

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Tuesday, March 21, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 206 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 225 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 302 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 252 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, presented a petition from 238 Edson and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 200 Rocky Mountain House residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 200 Edmonton residents stating that Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act will have far reaching, destructive consequences for all of us and all of our children, grandchildren, and great-grandchildren, and urging the Government to withdraw the Bill.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, presented a petition from 170 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 248 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, presented a petition from 307 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 175 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 396 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

Notices of Motions

Pursuant to Standing Order 34(2)(a), Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, gave oral notice of the following Written Questions and Motions for Returns to be dealt with Wednesday, March 22, 2000:

Written Questions: WQ9.

Motions for Returns: MR11, MR12, MR23.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer:

Treasury Ministry Business Plan 2000-2003

Sessional Paper 329/2000

Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer:

Study, undated, entitled "Public Policy Sources #39" prepared by The Fraser Institute

Sessional Paper 330/2000

Hon. Mr. Woloshyn, Minister of Community Development:

Letter dated March 21, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Woloshyn, Minister of Community Development, to Charlene Hay, Coordinator, Northern Alberta Alliance on Race Relations, congratulating the Northern Alberta Alliance on Race Relations on its commitment to address issues of discrimination.

Sessional Paper 331/2000

Information bulletin dated March 21, 2000, entitled "Alberta supports elimination of racism and discrimination" prepared by Alberta Community Development

Sessional Paper 332/2000

Hon. Dr. Oberg, Minister of Learning:

Report, undated, entitled "Supporting Safe, Secure and Caring Schools in Alberta" prepared by Alberta Learning

Sessional Paper 333/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Letter dated March 21, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, to Chris Duncan, News Director, A-Channel, expressing his concerns with the recent poll released by A-Channel on March 20, 2000, regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 334/2000

Mr. Tannas, Hon. Member for Highwood:

High River Times article dated March 14, 2000, entitled "Bill 11 is far from the devil in disguise"

Sessional Paper 335/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Outline of meeting with representatives of the Auditor General's Office and representatives of the Alberta Treasury Branches on March 23, 1995, regarding refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall

Sessional Paper 336/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Letter dated March 16, 2000, from Keith Purdy, President, Local 8, CUPE (Canadian Union of Public Employees), to an unnamed Member of the Legislative Assembly, expressing his concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 337/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Peace and Freedom article dated July/August 1989, entitled "White Privilege: Unpacking the Invisible Knapsack"

Sessional Paper 338/2000

Multicultural Community Project article, undated, entitled "Working With People With Differences"

Sessional Paper 339/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

Spring 2000 issue of Community Connections, an Edmonton Police Service publication

Sessional Paper 340/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Letter dated February 28, 2000, from Laureen Wright of Calgary, to Gobi Singh, Chief Executive Officer, Genesis Land Development Corporation, expressing her concerns with the Spray Development Corporation Project Description for Spray Resort, December 1999

Sessional Paper 341/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter dated March 16, 2000, from Keith Purdy, President, Local 8, CUPE (Canadian Union of Public Employees), to an unnamed Member of the Legislative Assembly, expressing his concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 342/2000

Letter dated November 9, 1998, unsigned, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding rotting, government-approved pine shakes

Sessional Paper 343/2000

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder:

Letter dated February 11, 2000, from Peter Nettleton of Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the December 1999 Spray Development Corporation Project Description for Spray Lake Resort and the Kananaskis Pathways Corporation Description for Mount Sparrowhawk Heli-Cat Ski Operation

Sessional Paper 344/2000

Letter dated March 7, 2000, from Nancy Hansen of Canmore, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, Mrs. Tarchuk, Hon. Member for Banff-Cochrane, Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the Director, Environmental Assessment and Strategy Division, and Gobi Singh, Chief Executive Officer, Genesis Land Development Corporation, expressing her thoughts on the proposed developments in the Spray Valley

Sessional Paper 345/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated March 6, 2000, from Dr. William C. Olsen, Professor Emeritus of Nuclear Physics, University of Alberta, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing his concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and requesting a plebiscite on the Bill

Sessional Paper 346/2000

Letter dated March 1, 2000, signed by 12 Albertans, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and urging Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier to stop his privatization of health care agenda

Sessional Paper 347/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Program from the Celebration of the Muslim Festival of Eid-Ul-Adha held in the Legislature Building Main Rotunda on March 20, 2000

Sessional Paper 348/2000

Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly:

2 letters dated March 15, 2000 and March 20, 2000, from the Ethics Commissioner to Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, indicating he will not be investigating the matter regarding Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie, referred to him by Dr. Pannu on March 8, 2000

Sessional Paper 349/2000

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, tabled the following:

Draft report dated March 11, 1996, entitled "Building Partnerships in Health Care Restructuring, The Use of Clinical Practice Guidelines, Outcome Analysis, Optical Cards and Telus Health Solutions" prepared by Dennis L. Modry, M.D.

Sessional Paper 350/2000

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, tabled the following:

Globe and Mail article dated June 3, 1988, entitled "Ontario health bill may flout free trade pact" and Toronto Star article dated September 9, 1989, entitled "More private clinics coming, new bill reverses 50 years of hospital policy by beginning privatization trend"

Sessional Paper 351/2000

Members' Statements

Mr. Ducharme, Hon. Member for Bonnyville-Cold Lake, made a statement regarding the Francophone Secretariat and the reception on March 21, 2000, hosted by the Speaker and the Legislative Assembly in the Legislature Building rotunda for the leaders of the Francophone community celebrating the first anniversary of the establishment of the Francophone Secretariat.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, made a statement regarding the United Nations International Day for Elimination of Racial Discrimination, March 21, 2000, and activities taking place around Alberta to celebrate this day.

Mr. Pham, Hon. Member for Calgary-Montrose, made a statement regarding the United Nations International Day for Elimination of Racial Discrimination, March 21, 2000, remembering events of historical significance in terms of racial discrimination, and noting that the number of complaints filed with the Human Rights Commission on racism have steadily declined over the past few years.

Point of Order

During a Point of Order, Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, tabled the following:

Document entitled "WEM (West Edmonton Mall) Evidentiary References Re: Document Involvement in Refinancing, Tab #30, Crown's Production #17906"
Sessional Paper 352/2000

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole, and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker assumed the Chair.

The following Bill was reported:

Bill 205 Emblems of Alberta (Alberta Dress Tartan) Amendment Act, 2000 —
Mr. Stevens

Motions Other Than Government Motions

504. Moved by Mrs. MacBeth:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to create an Alberta Citizen's Commission on the Future of Education which would set goals and direction for education, acknowledging its fundamental importance to the prosperity and well-being of all Albertans, and defining a clear vision for its future.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was defeated.

505. Moved by Mrs. Fritz:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to establish an Advisory Council on Women's Health to support education and research promoting women's health, and to address issues relating to the prevention and treatment of diseases including osteoporosis, eating disorders, heart disease, breast cancer as well as diseases to which women are becoming increasingly susceptible to such as lung cancer and auto-immune diseases.

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(c), debate adjourned, Mrs. Soetaert speaking.

Committee of Supply (Day 19 — Main Estimates)

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker resumed the Chair and Mr. Renner reported as follows:

Madam Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions, reports as follows, and requests leave to sit again:

Resolved that a sum not exceeding the following be granted to Her Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2001, for the Departments and purposes indicated:

Executive Council

\$15,298,000	Operating Expense
\$250,000	Non-budgetary Disbursements

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, it was agreed at 5:27 p.m., that when the Assembly reconvened at 8:00 p.m. it would be in Committee of Supply, and the Acting Speaker left the Chair.

TUESDAY, MARCH 21, 2000 — 8:00 P.M.

Committee of Supply (Day 19 — Main Estimates)

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair and Mr. Renner reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions (reported from the Designated Supply Subcommittee), reports as follows, and requests leave to sit again:

Resolved that a sum not exceeding the following be granted to Her Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2001, for the Departments and purposes indicated:

Human Resources and Employment

\$1,034,970,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment

Children's Services

\$535,540,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment

Environment

\$332,506,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment

The Committee of Supply has also had under consideration certain resolutions, reports as follows, and requests leave to sit again:

Resolved that a sum not exceeding the following be granted to Her Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2001, for the Departments and purposes indicated:

Treasury

\$139,438,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment
\$98,941,000 Non-budgetary Disbursements

Gaming

\$183,191,000 Operating Expense

Infrastructure

\$2,152,558,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment

Innovation and Science

\$184,867,000 Operating Expense

Mr. Speaker, I would like to table copies of an amendment proposed during Committee of Supply consideration of the Estimates of the Department of Treasury:

Amendment to the Estimates of the Department of Treasury (Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora) — Defeated

Sessional Paper 353/2000

Mr. Speaker, I would also like to table copies of a document tabled by Hon. Mr. Smith, Minister of Gaming, during Committee of Supply consideration of the Estimates of the Department of Gaming:

Responses to questions raised on February 29, 2000, Department of Gaming, 2000-2001 Committee of Supply debate

Sessional Paper 354/2000

Mr. Speaker, I would also like to table copies of a document tabled by Hon. Dr. Taylor, Minister of Innovation and Science, during Committee of Supply consideration of the Estimates of the Department of Innovation and Science:

Responses to questions raised on March 7, 2000, Department of Innovation and Science, 2000-2001 Committee of Supply debate

Sessional Paper 355/2000

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

Government Bills and Orders

Third Reading

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 1 Alberta Heritage Foundation for Science and Engineering Research Act (\$)
— Hon. Mr. Klein

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:41 p.m. until Wednesday, March 22, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Tuesday, March 21, 2000